

# OZONE AND NOX UPDATE

CIBO E&E MEETING  
SEPTEMBER 15 & 16, 2015

BRITTANY M PEMBERTON  
BRACEWELL & GIULIANI  
LLP

# OZONE NAAQS

**THOUGH BENNY'S INTEREST IN SCIENCE WAS  
COMMENDABLE, SOME OF HIS EXPERIMENTS  
WERE ILL-ADVISED.**



# Ozone NAAQS

## CIBO Participation

- **2008 Ozone NAAQS :75 ppb**
- **11/25/14 proposal: 65–70 ppb**
- **Coalition comments filed 3/17/15**
- **Joint industry letters to President: June and July 2015**

# Ozone NAAQS

## Potential Impact of Lower Standard

- **65–70 ppb range**
  - EPA: \$3.9 billion/year by 2025
- **Large number of areas in nonattainment**
  - 15 of top 20 metropolitan area economies in nonattainment at 70 ppb
- **EPA projects most of country in attainment by 2025**

# Ozone NAAQS

## OMB Review of Final Rule

- **10/1/15 court deadline for final rule**
- **Final rule at OMB since 8/28**
  - EPA may be seeking 70 ppb
  - White House could lower standard to 68 ppb

# Ozone NAAQS

## OMB Stakeholder Meetings

- **NAAQS Implementation Coalition**
- **Phillips 66**
- **NAM**
- **U.S. Chamber**
- **NESCAUM**
- **AFPM**
- **IPAA**
- **API**
- **PCA**
- **AF&PA**
- **American Academy of Pediatrics**
- **American Thoracic Society**
- **American Lung Association**

# NOX CONTROL COST MANUAL



# NOx Control Cost Manual

## EPA Proposed Revisions

- **SNCR, SCR cost estimates last updated 2002**
- **include equations to estimate installation & O&M cost**
  - used to estimate costs of rules and of controls (BACT, BART, e.g.)
- **EPA sought comment on**
  - reasonable estimate of equipment life
  - difference between utility and industrial costs
  - reasonable contingency factor



# NOx Control Cost Manual

## Coalition Comments

### ■ Coalition Members:

- ACC
- AF&PA
- American Wood Council
- AFPM
- BIA

### ■ Coalition Comments (9/10/15):

- too much reliance on utility units
- controls not always effective for certain types/sizes of units
- more emphasis on operating costs
- SNCR cost: > \$2,000/MMBtu/hr (much higher than utility boilers)
- SCR catalyst cost: \$8,000 - \$10,000/m<sup>3</sup>

# **NOx Control Cost Manual**

## **CIBO Input**

- **capital recovery factor wrong**
- **installation cost for retrofits impacted by space constraints**
- **performance testing cost must be included**
- **SNCR capital cost directly related to boiler load range while controlled**
- **equipment life: SNCR 10-20 yrs, SCR 20 yrs**
- **reasonable contingency factor: 10-15%, up to ~25% based on site conditions**